Statements of Heritage Impact (SOHI)

Part 1

Proposed demolition of existing

Residential Building

66 Cox Street Mudgee Lot 3 DP 1099274



FIGURE 1 FAÇADE OF EXISTING HOUSE AT 66 COX STREET MUDGEE

Client: Gemma Toole

Date: 21 April 2023

STATEMENT OF HERITAGE IMPACT

By 'Impact' this report covers any effect that may alter the significance of the place. It can be a visual or physical effect. It can be a small effect or large. Having an 'impact' on a heritage area does not mean that such a proposal cannot proceed. The description of the impact will enable council staff to determine whether to approve such a development, and if the impact is acceptable.

This statement of Heritage impact is required because the existing residence is proposed to be demolished and a new residence is to be built within the space.

No 66 Cox Street, or Lot 1 DP 1099274 is in a residential area of Mudgee, just within the Mudgee Conservation Area. It is located on the western edge of the Conservation area. There are no individually listed heritage items in the vicinity. (The nearest item is at the corner of Denison and Cox Streets).



FIGURE 2: AERIAL VIEW FROM SIX-MAPS, NO 66 HIGHLIGHTED.



SUMMARY

The proposed existing residential building will be removed because it is unrepairable. Its removal will make way for a new infill building. The existing residence is uninhabited and has been for many decades. It is in an extremely poor state and cannot be repaired or conserved for reuse. The building has no services. As per the MWRC LEP 2012, the Council requires a statement addressing any heritage impacts for the proposed works before a Development Application can be approved.

THE SOHI IS DIVIDED INTO 2 PARTS.

Part 1. Removal or demolition of the existing residence.

Part 2. Design and construct a new house, in-filling a vacant lot. Building a new house here, of the right scale, setback, and materials, will help to retain or establish a cohesive streetscape. This Part 2 will form part of the next DA for the new residence.



FIGURE 2 STREETSCAPE IMAGE SHOWING THE WEST SIDE OF COX STREET.

THE SETTING

The streetscape is a row of simple single story residential buildings of different eras from c. 1895 (No 66) and later houses of fibro and brick. (c. 1950-70s). Across the street is a similar mix of period houses from late Victorian to 1950s and 1970s. (The central house opposite was built c. 1970s but is obscured by vegetation). There is no strong aesthetic in the street except for low scale, modest houses set close to front boundaries.



FIGURE **3** STREETSCAPE EAST SIDE OF COX STREET.

Statements of significance

<u>66 Cox Street</u> is not a listed heritage item. Its significance is however apparent in its age being an historic, c. 1890s, settler's cottage on what was then, the western end of Mudgee. It is a typical cottage of the day, being small scale, timber framed, and weatherboard clad, with corrugated iron and bull nosed front verandah. Very little original fabric remains in fair condition.

The Mudgee Conservation Area is a heritage listed area. Its significance is as follows:

The settlement of Mudgee, located along the banks of the Cudgegong River, demonstrates the principal characteristic of early government town layout in NSW. Designated land uses include the Anglican and Catholic churches in key central positions, with reserved land for law and order, education, and recreation, following government practice of the day.

Initial settlement occurred in 1822 with many pioneer families still represented in the town today. The Heritage Conservation Area of Mudgee closely follows the 1884 parish map of the town and retains many key heritage buildings especially in the central business area of Church and Market Streets. Historically significant buildings on corners include the Post Office, the Anglican and Catholic churches, hotels, and banks, all of which help frame the central shopping area. Many impressive commercial, civic, and religious buildings of similar late Victorian style and scale, such as the former Town Hall, banks, hotels and churches, form the core of the Conservation Area, creating an aesthetically significant NSW country town. Remnants of early road works, stone kerbs and gutters, are extant and contribute to the setting.

Two excellent parks, Robertson Park and Lawson Park, set aside in the initial surveys of the town, provide partial boundaries to the commercial core. The town setting is also framed by the backdrop of the hills, reminding residents of the original meaning of Mudgee: the 'nest in the hills'. Mudgee also has a good stock of heritage listed houses beyond the central business area. In a special category are those buildings designed by Mudgee architect Harold Hardwick in the 1890s to 1920s because of their quality.

Heritage impact: The removal of the early cottage will create some loss of heritage significance to the streetscape. However, the material effect of the demolition on the Heritage Significance of the Mudgee Conservation Area will be low as the streetscape is mixed and not of a similar period. A positive effect can be created through new infill, to enable the streetscape to be more cohesive, rather than being occupied by a derelict building that has been vacant for many years. A new infill should help strengthen streetscape cohesion.

History

Sarah Jane. Carter	George James Arthur Jupp	Miles H John Lyons Healy	Miles. H. W. F. Jumes Bawar Lyons Starbury Jupa Bayle 0.2.0 0.2.0 0.2.0
0.2.38 2 William.	020 0.2.0 5 Sarah Blackman	0 2 0. 0 2 0 John Healy 20	0.2.0. 0.2.0. 0.2.0. 0.2.0. 5 James Batten. Miles H. Lyons. 20 0.2.0. 0.2.0. 0.2.0.
Gossage: 0. 2 38.	Sarah Blackman	John Healy 19	James Batten Hugh Farrel
Mary A Carter	John Caton 2	John Bosworth	Simon Brown. James Batten
N. 27100 0. 2. 38.	0	A. R. B. Cochrane.	B John Orchard Filmen James Jupp
William. Hughes 0 2 38	John Caton	A. R. B. Cochrane	⁹ John Orchard Bdward Bayly ¹⁰ Henry Holt John Wright
Sarah Blackman	Sarah Blackman 0 2 0. 0 2 0	John ¹³ A. R. B. ¹⁴ Caton Cochrane. 0 2 0 0 2 0	Francis Evan Bran 14 Brancis Evan Bran Bran 14 Gunningham Gunningham Richards Richards Bran 14 0.2.0 9.2.0 0.2.0
	N	and the second	DENISON

FIGURE 10: PART OF THE PARISH MAP 1903

No 66 Cox Street was Formerly part of 3 of section 22 in the above parish map of Mudgee. Mudgee was proclaimed in March 1885; the land in Cox Street was included in the town from 28th January 1893. The first sale was probably soon after that date and the first owner, Mary Carter, who may have been the first owner of this house which appears to date close to that year c. 1895.

The land at 66 Cox Street now represents only approximately 50% of the original lot which has been subdivided up as the layout of the street overall changed in time. When the first owner Mary A. Carter, bought the land it would have potentially been a small holding, being an area of 2 acres. There was probably a home garden, and horse or cow paddock, and in the then centre of the land is an intermittent stream passing through it.

The land that now forms 66 Cox Street is reduced in size to 500M2, having been subdivided from the larger lot many decades ago. The house is located just over its southern boundary and close to the front (eastern) boundary. Indications are, as the earliest house in the vicinity.

For many decades until 1980, members of the Fitzpatrick family lived here and were long time members of the Mudgee Community. Many Fitzpatrick members such as the C. Fitzpatrick's family were raised in this house. The most recent inhabitants being Kevin Fitzpatrick and family. Part of a large Catholic family, Kevin attended St Matthews Primary School in the early 1950s. The land was sold by Thelma Mary Fitzpatrick, then a widow, in 1980, to Leslie and Shirley Gordon Pyne, changing the title from Old System to Torrens Title.

Cox Street was possibly the location for several Fitzpatrick families. For example The Mudgee Guardian 20 Nov 1952 refers to the wedding of one RJ Fitzpatrick, of Cox Street, being married at St. Mary's church.

BOCK 3439 501 NO. CONVEYANCE NEW SOUTH WALES \$ +01.00 STANT DUTY THIS DEED made the Fist day of Daly Gns thousand mins hundred and sighty DETWEEN DEELKS MARY FITZPATHICE of Mudges in the State of New South Wales, Widow (herminefter celled the Vendor) of the One part AND LESLIE CORCON PYNE of Mudges aforesaid, Shop Secletant and SHIPLEY EILER PERE of Mudges aforebald, Married Woman (hereinefter called the Purchasers) of the Uther part WHEREAS the Vendor build seleed for an estate in fee simple in the land hereinefter described on agroud to wall the sime to the Purchasers of the price of flut THERMAND BOLLARS (\$5,000.00) from from encomptences MOW THIS DIED WITNISSED: that in consideration of the sum of \$5,000.00 to the Vendor paid by the Purchasors in squal shares (the receipt shereof is hereby soknowindged) the Varidur as benaficial mover <u>COTH HEREBY CONVEY</u> onto the Purchasers <u>ALL THAT</u> piece or parcel of land bring portion of Allotrent Mo. 3 of Section No. 22 four and Parish of Mudgew County of Wellington and State of New South Valey CONTINCING at a point on the west aids of Cox Streat being 82' south of the south east corner of Allateent No. 7 and bounded on the morth by a line bearing westerly at right angles to Cox Street 106' on the west by a line 20 southerly percilel to Cox Street 53" on the south by a line centurly at right angles in the edaturn boundary 106' to Dox Streat and on the seat by 50' of the wost aids of Dox Streat northerly to the point of communication TO HOLD unto the Purchasers in Fee simple as taments in cowson in squal shares. IN WITHERS WHEREFF the Vonder has becaused subscribed her nees and affixed her seel on the day and year first horsinbefore written. SIGNED SEALED AND DELIVERED] by the sold THELMA MARY T. R. Fitzpetrick FIT2PATRICK in the presence 150 S. H. Soberts 153 Market St. Mudgee, M.S.M. Huma Dution. On 20th August, 1900, 1, 11004 LOUISE KUNTZ of Mudgar, Clurk to Williams & Williams, Mudgas, 51 Solicitors, way on daths. The writing contained on this page has used openared by we with the original instrument and is a true copy thursef, SACEN at Mudgae) Linda Theats nefure set Ambullions Selicitor, Muddee. ACCESTENCE in the office of the Registers Seminal at Sydney this 20th any of November 1990 at 3 minutes past 12 statesk and larged by Julie Alchim and musbered 501 Book 3439 mill H

FIGURE 4 TRANSFER FROM FITZGERALD TO PYNE IN 1980.

Physical Description

As the earliest house in this vicinity, the small late Victorian timber cottage sits along the South side boundary and close to the front, eastern boundary of Cox Street.

The house now comprises an almost open space under a steeply pitch corrugated galvanised iron roof with straight iron roofed, (former) verandahs. To the rear another gable ended single room structure was built and became an extension to the first house. The initial house, running North-South, was of three rooms, but a partition wall has been removed and doors and windows boarded over. The south wall is of English bond, incorporating the original chimney. Externally the wall shows and the transition from first house to the additions, by a change in bricks colour.

Another indication of the staged construction is the gap between the hipped front roof and the back roof. This difficult detail would contribute to roof leakage.



FIGURE 5 VIEW FROM THE NORTH SIDE

External wall cladding includes fibro, or fc sheet, face brickwork, rendered masonry, vertical boarding, and horizontal weatherboards, rustic at the side and fine on the façade. The roof in corrugated iron is original material in short sheets of approximate six feet.



FIGURE 6 SOUTH FACING GABLE SHOWING THE ORIGINAL ENGLISH BOND BRICKWORK.

2023

Possibly the house spaces were used for storage in recent years, as the removal of partitions has created open spaces. The front fireplace still has its timber surround.



Floors are timber boards, close to ground.

The front verandah's lining boards are fine dressed weatherboards, which have been protected over the decades. They could be salvaged for other uses, if they are pine and not cypress.



FIGURE 7 INTERNAL REAR ROOM SHOWING A PARTIAL COLLAPSE OF AN INTERNAL BRICK WALL: POSSIBLY A FIREPLACE.



FIGURE 8 FRONT ROOM FIREPLACE AND SURROUND, FORMERLY BRICKED UP.

Overall, a very derelict and neglected building without any services. Some salvageable materials should be offered off the site.

Heritage Objectives

Heritage Objectives and the MWRC LEP

The MWRC LEP 2012 provides the following information with respect to the management of Environmental Heriatge. **The most relevant clauses are in bold.**

(1) Objectives

The objectives of this clause are as follows:

(a) to conserve the environmental heritage of Mid-Western Regional,

(b) to conserve the heritage significance of heritage items and heritage conservation areas, including associated fabric, settings and views,

- (c) to conserve archaeological sites,
- (d) to conserve Aboriginal objects and Aboriginal places of heritage significance.
- (2) Requirement for consent

Development consent is required for any of the following:

(a) demolishing or moving any of the following or altering the exterior of any of the following (including, in the case of a building, making changes to its detail, fabric, finish or appearance):

- (i) a heritage item,
- (ii) an Aboriginal object,
- (iii) a building, work, relic or tree within a heritage conservation area,

(b) altering a heritage item that is a building by making structural changes to its interior or by making changes to anything inside the item that is specified in Schedule 5 in relation to the item,

(c) disturbing or excavating an archaeological site while knowing, or having reasonable cause to suspect, that the disturbance or excavation will or is likely to result in a relic being discovered, exposed, moved, damaged or destroyed,

(d) disturbing or excavating an Aboriginal place of heritage significance,

(e) erecting a building on land:

2023

(i) on which a heritage item is located or that is within a heritage conservation area, or

(ii) on which an Aboriginal object is located or that is within an Aboriginal place of heritage significance,

(f) subdividing land:

(i) on which a heritage item is located or that is within a heritage conservation area, or

(ii) on which an Aboriginal object is located or that is within an Aboriginal place of heritage significance.

(3) When consent not required

However, development consent under this clause is not required if:

(a) the applicant has notified the consent authority of the proposed development and the consent authority has advised the applicant in writing before any work is carried out that it is satisfied that the proposed development:

(i) is of a minor nature or is for the maintenance of the heritage item, Aboriginal object, Aboriginal place of heritage significance or archaeological site or a building, work, relic, tree or place within the heritage conservation area, and

(ii) would not adversely affect the heritage significance of the heritage item, Aboriginal object, Aboriginal place, archaeological site or heritage conservation area, or

(b) the development is in a cemetery or burial ground and the proposed development:

(i) is the creation of a new grave or monument, or excavation or disturbance of land for the purpose of conserving or repairing monuments or grave markers, and

(ii) would not cause disturbance to human remains, relics, Aboriginal objects in the form of grave goods, or to an Aboriginal place of heritage significance, or

(c) the development is limited to the removal of a tree or other vegetation that the Council is satisfied is a risk to human life or property, or

(d) the development is exempt development.

(4) Effect of proposed development on heritage significance

The consent authority must, before granting consent under this clause in respect of a heritage item or heritage conservation area, consider the effect of the proposed development on the heritage significance of the item or area concerned. This subclause applies regardless of whether a heritage management document is prepared under subclause (5) or a heritage conservation management plan is submitted under subclause (6).

(5) Heritage assessment

The consent authority may, before granting consent to any development:

- (a) on land on which a heritage item is located, or
- (b) on land that is within a heritage conservation area, or
- (c) on land that is within the vicinity of land referred to in paragraph (a) or (b),

require a heritage management document to be prepared that assesses the extent to which the carrying out of the proposed development would affect the heritage significance of the heritage item or heritage conservation area concerned.

(6) Heritage conservation management plans.

The consent authority may require, after considering the heritage significance of a heritage item and the extent of change proposed to it, the submission of a heritage conservation management plan before granting consent under this clause.

Comment on the MWRC Heritage Objectives

The house is not a listed item but is within the Mudgee Conservation area. The house in being demolished will not comply with the heritage objectives of 'conserving the heritage of the conservation area. However, the house is derelict and not possible to be saved.

This land will then accommodate a new residence on what will then be a vacant site. The streetscape does not have strong appeal due to this long deserted house.

The Heritage Impact caused by the proposed demolition of a house and its replacement 'will not adversely affect the heritage significance of the Mudgee Heritage Conservation Area.' There are no heritage listed items in the nearby vicinity, and no consistent period or style of dwelling in the vicinity.

RECOMMENDATIONS

- 1. A small number of materials can be salvaged and passed onto others for use. Some face bricks, the timber fireplace surround and the front weatherboard cladding. These should be carefully removed.
- 2. An archival record of digital photographic record should be made before and during demolition. During demolition hidden aspects of the method of construction can then be recorded. This record will need to be in two parts. Before and during demolition.
- 3. A look out for any unforeseen relics, especially during the demolition process, such as objects under the floorboards. Report back to the heritage adviser and include in the photographic record.

STATEMENT OF HERITAGE IMPACT FOR DEMOLITION

Address and property description: of the Proposed development

66 Cox Street Mudgee

Prepared by:

Barbara Hickson

Office at 103 Market St Mudgee.

Owner of the proposed development site

Gemma Toole

A brief description of proposal

An existing late Victorian residence in very poor condition and without services, is proposed to be demolished. Then a new residence is proposed for the vacant lot. The location is on the edge of the Mudgee Conservation Area. The proposed house will contribute the streetscape.

Date: 21 April 2023

STATEMENT OF HERITAGE IMPACT

1 why the item is of	The Mudage Concernation Area is significant because
1. why the item is of	The Mudgee Conservation Area is significant because
heritage significance.	The settlement of Mudgee, located along the banks of the Cudgegong River, demonstrates the principal characteristic of early government town layout in NSW. Designated land uses include the Anglican and Catholic churches in key central positions, with reserved land for law and order, education, and recreation, following government practice of the day. Initial settlement occurred in 1822 with many pioneer families still represented in the town today.
	The Heritage Conservation Area of Mudgee closely follows the 1884 parish map of the town and retains many key heritage buildings especially in the central business area of Church and Market Streets. Historically significant buildings on corners include the Post Office, the Anglican and Catholic churches, hotels, and banks, all of which help frame the central shopping area. Many impressive commercial, civic, and religious buildings of similar late Victorian style and scale, such as the former Town Hall, banks, hotels and churches, form the core of the Conservation Area, creating an aesthetically significant NSW country town. Remnants of early road works, stone kerbs and gutters, are extant and contribute to the setting.
2. what positive impact will the proposed works have on its significance.	The removal of a derelict house, which has been unused for many decades, will be a positive on the residential amenity of the area.
3. what negative impact	When the former 1890s house is removed, significance of the
will the proposed works	streetscape will be affected. This is probably the oldest house in
have on its significance.	the vicinity.
4. what measures are	Replacement of the former residence with a new low scale house
proposed to mitigate the	to maintain streetscape continuity.
negative impacts	

Demolition of existing residence at 66 Cox Street Mudgee

5. why were more	The existing house is uninhabitable and unsalvageable. Adding a		
sympathetic solutions are	new residence to the proposed vacant lot will improve the		
not viable.	streetscape.		



Barbara Hickson HERITAGE ADVISER